

MORGUE

1/24/68

1/24/68



LIBRARY COPY  
PLEASE RETURN

A Presentation to Hon. W.A.C. Bennett,  
Prime Minister of British Columbia  
at the October 21, 1968 Public Hearing  
on the Roberts Bank Rail Route by  
D.A.S. Lanskaill, Chairman,  
Lower Mainland Regional Planning Board

The basic points that the Lower Mainland Regional Planning Board has made regarding the Roberts Bank rail route are contained in the brief Rail Service to the Roberts Bank Port Facility, adopted by the Board September 12th, and in the report Our Southwestern Shores, currently before the Board. Copies of the 34 briefs, presented to the Board at its August 28th Public Hearing on the B.C. Hydro southern rail route, are published in the Submissions document. These publications together with the Board's earlier studies on Industrial Land Prospects, are submitted as exhibits to this presentation.

The points below augment our earlier work, and summarize our reactions to the proposals of Mr. Broadbent, Vice-President and General Manager, Pacific Great Eastern Railway, in the Route Report for Rail Access to Roberts Bank, dated October 15th, 1968.

1. The Board feels that the new rail route proposal is a considerable improvement over the B.C. Hydro route proposal. Mr. Broadbent is to be commended for:
  - (a) proposing a route which eliminates the disruption that would have resulted in Matsqui and eastern Langley had the B.C. Hydro route proposal been accepted.
  - (b) proposing a route which respects the recreation potential of Boundary Bay, a proposed regional park of unequalled importance for beach recreation on the Pacific coast.
  - (c) proposing the removal of tracks from the White Rock-Crescent Beach waterfront in order to facilitate the safe and full use of the shoreline as part of a regional park.
2. We would wish to correct the description of the Northern Route as proposed by this Board as it is described in the report of Mr. Broadbent.

- . The rail route along the Fraser River across Delta Municipality would form part of an established rail-industrial corridor established in the Official Regional Plan for the Lower Mainland.
  - . The Fraser River route would not involve swing span rail bridges as indicated in Mr. Broadbent's report. The proposal is for low level bridges as part of a causeway crossing of the Deas Slough and the mouth of the present Ladner Harbour. The waterway could be open with structures designed for clearance of pleasure craft.
  - . There are two time dimensions in the Regional Planning Board's proposal. The first dimension is an immediate or interim proposal, with CPR gaining running rights over the CNR lines to North Delta and thence over an extension to Roberts Bank. The second dimension is the long run scheme whereby the interim route operation forms part of an integrated rail system. The integrated system would see an upgrading of CNR lines in North Surrey, and replacement of the present New Westminster rail bridge with a double track facility more suitably located.
3. The orientation of the Regional Planning Board is to consider the provision of rail service to Roberts Bank in light of the following general considerations, which we present here as basic principles for railway route planning:
- (a) the lowest cost of construction, maintenance and operation.
  - (b) the greatest ability for direct high-speed movement of trains with a minimum of interruption by crossings or by local industrial spurs.
  - (c) the minimum of present and future disruption to the people and communities of the Lower Mainland.
  - (d) the fullest utilization of existing rail facilities.
  - (e) the greatest accessibility by all Railways.
  - (f) the full respect for the present and ultimate best use of the land resource.
  - (g) the lowest cost to local government in the construction, maintenance and operation of local public works.
  - (h) the co-ordination of rail line projects with local development projects in order to see achievement of multiple beneficial developments.

It is readily apparent that some of these principles can conflict with one another. We would point out that to focus on the achievement of one principle could well obliterate achievement of another. We submit that the objective must be to maximize the achievement of all of these principles if the best answer is to be found for a rail route to Roberts Bank through the Lower Mainland.

4. Within this framework of general principles for determining rail route locations, the Board feels that the proposed route along the Fraser River tying in with the established industrial-rail corridor is superior to the route proposed along Boundary Bay, or to the route following the old Guichon railway roadbed. We have compiled the following Table to compare how each rail route proposal measures in meeting the general principles.

Respectfully submitted on behalf  
of the Lower Mainland Regional  
Planning Board

D.A.S. Lanskail  
Chairman  
October 21, 1968

CRITERIA	COMPARISON OF ALTERNATE RAIL ROUTES TO ROBERTS BANK		
	Matsqui Via Boundary Bay (Boundary Bay Route)	Ft. Langley-Guichon Roadbed (Middle Route)	Fraser River Corridor (Northern Route)
Cost of construction, maintenance and operation	43 mile link; 17 miles of rebuilt B.C. Hydro line; 7 miles of re-located B.C. Hydro line; 19 miles of new roadbed across Surrey and Boundary Bay. Requires eighteen new grade separated crossings; 14 signalized crossings.	45 mile link; 26.7 miles of new construction; 3.7 miles of re-construction of B.C. Hydro line. Requires eleven new grade separated crossings; fifteen signalized crossings. Requires new swing span bridge at Albion-Fort Langley.	48 mile link requires 8 miles new construction from Tilbury Island to Roberts Bank. Possible structure over entrance to Massey Tunnel; causeway structure at Deas Slough 600 feet; causeway structure at Ladner Harbour about 4,000 feet. Requires five new grade separated crossings; twelve signalized crossings.
Operation and maintenance costs	Operation and maintenance costs on Boundary Bay link will be determined by roadbed foundation conditions encountered in Bay; problems in drainage and footings known to exist in Mud Bay area; peat soils in Colebrook-Cloverdale area will require special design of roadbed. Topographic problems in Matsqui area. Right-of-way acquisition over approximately eleven miles of the route.	Operation and maintenance costs will be dependent on foundation conditions; peat soils in Colebrook-Cloverdale area will require special design of roadbed. Operating agreements with CNR required until new Albion span crossing is constructed. Right-of-way acquisition over approximately twenty miles of the route.	Operation and maintenance costs will be dependent on design of causeway structures in bypassing the Ladner area. Roadbed to be floodproofed. Relocation of Ladner Harbour could be cost financed under joint federal-provincial programme. Minimum land acquisition programme for right-of-way over approximately five miles of the route.
Ability for direct high-speed movement of rail traffic	Conflicts with local industrial rail switching in Langley City and Cloverdale; maximum grades in Matsqui and 35 level crossings a potential interference with high speed rail movement.	Conflicts with local industrial rail switching in Langley City and Cloverdale; 38 level crossings a potential interference to rail movements.	Conflicts with industrial rail traffic in North Surrey; requires addition of service trackage and planning of the port-industrial areas to ensure through routes for unit trains; 31 level crossings would lie along the river where less cross traffic would be developed than in the case of a route through the central area of the Municipalities.
Present and future disruption of people and their communities	Traverses 17 miles of farmland on new sections of roadbed; lies relatively close to major urban areas of Matsqui, Langley, and Surrey throughout 10 miles of new or upgraded rail line. Follows Boundary Bay shoreline for 9 miles and presents conflicts with the major recreation conservation area on the British Columbia coast.	Traverses 19 miles of farmland on new sections of roadbed; within close proximity to major urban areas in Langley and Surrey throughout 10 miles of new or upgraded line.	Traverses 2 1/2 miles of farmland in new sections of roadbed; 3 miles of new or rebuilt rail line are in close proximity to major urban areas of Surrey and Delta; disrupts existing harbour at Ladner but can be tied into Ladner Harbour expansion and Urban Renewal programmes.
Utilization of existing rail route facilities	Uses existing B.C. Hydro Fraser Valley line, but would see change to main-line status and necessitate 17 miles rebuilt to main-line standards; 26 miles of new roadbed and track; creates a new rail route separate from rest of Lower Mainland rail network.	Uses the CNR main-line from Matsqui to Port Langley; requires 3.7 miles of B.C. Hydro line rebuilt to main-line standards, and 26 miles of new roadbed and track; requires new CPR span at Albion; relationship to overall rail network not clear.	Uses the existing CNR main-line from Matsqui to Tilbury Island; requires construction of 8 miles of new roadbed and track; provides opportunity to develop this new link as part of integrated, joint operated terminal rail network in Lower Mainland operating from the major rail yards located on the Metropolitan fringe; forms part of planned and partly developed industrial-rail corridor.
Accessibility by all railways	Under agreement, we understand all railways would gain access at the Colebrook junction: CPR would run from Matsqui over the extended and rebuilt B.C. Hydro route; CNR would run over the Great Northern tracks from the Port Mann area; PGE would run over existing lines of either CNR or CPR to reach the Colebrook junction.	Under agreement, we understand that CPR would run from Matsqui to Port Langley over CNR tracks, then over the extended and rebuilt B.C. Hydro route to Colebrook; CNR would run from Port Mann over the Great Northern tracks; PGE would run over existing CNR and CPR lines to reach the Fort Langley junction and then run over the B.C. Hydro route.	Under an interim agreement, we would see CPR traffic run over the CNR lines from Matsqui through to Roberts Bank from Tilbury Island until such time as a new Fraser River Rail Bridge is constructed to carry CPR traffic from a more westerly point on the CPR system; the new bridge would form part of the improved joint rail system serving all the metropolitan port areas.
Respect for the present and future best use of the land	Introduces industrial conflicts in rural farm areas in Matsqui, Langley Township, Surrey and South Delta; conflicts with recreation-conservation interests in Boundary Bay; has adverse impact on urban areas of Cloverdale and Panorama Ridge areas of Surrey; dredging of Boundary Bay for fill materials could be detrimental to wildlife habitat of Bay, and to future park development.	Introduces industrial conflicts in rural farm areas in Langley Township, Surrey and South Delta; conflicts with urban development in Langley City; adverse impact on urban areas of Cloverdale and Panorama Ridge of Surrey, and in Port Langley.	Conflict with rural farm areas confined to two lineal miles of track west of Ladner, affecting lands adjacent to those expropriated as port back-up land; conflict with Ladner Harbour area, but provides opportunity to redevelop Ladner Harbour and Town Centre; complements plans for industrial-rail corridor on Fraser River; does not conflict with Boundary Bay or Surrey Island areas which are excellently suited for recreation-conservation use.
Cost to local government in local public works	Route creates problems for designing and constructing crossings for local roads, utilities, drainage and other projects in Matsqui, Langley, Surrey, and parts of Delta; since route passes through central areas of the Municipalities, problems presented for all road and utility systems.	Route creates problems for designing and constructing crossings for local roads, utilities, drainage and similar projects in West Langley, Surrey, and Delta. Since route passes through central areas of the Municipalities, problems presented for all road and utility systems.	Route creates a minimum of conflict with roads, utilities and drainage works except in the Ladner area; route is peripheral to the developing areas of the Municipalities it passes through.
Co-ordination of rail route with plans for local development	Road proposed by B.C. Hydro to provide access to Boundary Bay to enable development and use of Bay for recreation-conservation use; potential problem that road access plans not part of an overall park development plan for the Bay.	Route proposes a bypass of Langley City and would see mid-City rail line abandoned; however, problems are introduced in the planning for major road accesses in Langley City area.	Ladner Boat Harbour development and Downtown Ladner urban renewal scheme could benefit from construction of rail route in Northern corridor; present harbour could be redeveloped for Downtown park and residential area.